

City of Santa Barbara Planning Division

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, May 16, 2007 David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street 1:30 P.M.

COMMISSION MEMBERS: WILLIAM LA VOIE, *Chair* – Present until 3:17 p.m. and again at 3:21 p.m.

ALEX PUJO, Vice-Chair – Present ROBERT ADAMS – Present LOUISE BOUCHER – Present STEVE HAUSZ – Absent

FERMINA MURRAY – Present SUSETTE NAYLOR – Present DONALD SHARPE – Present

ADVISORY MEMBER: DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: ROGER HORTON – Present 2:18 p.m. to 3:20 p.m.

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: STELLA LARSON – Absent **STAFF:** JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 2:00 p.m.

JAKE JACOBUS, Urban Historian – Absent SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician II – Present GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

Website: www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov

		HIGTODIC I ANDMADIZE COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SUBMITTAL CHECKLIST		
(See El Pueblo Viejo District Guidelines & Design Review Submittal Requirements for Details)		
CONCEPT	Required	Master Application & Submittal Fee - (Location: 630 Garden Street)
REVIEW		Photographs - of the existing building (if any), adjacent structures, composite panoramic view of the site, surrounding areas &
		neighborhood streetscape - mounted or folded to no larger than an 8.5" x 14" photo display board.
		Plans - three sets of folded plans are required at the time of submittal & each time plans are revised.
		Vicinity Map and Project Tabulations - (Include on first drawing)
		Site Plan - drawn to scale showing the property boundaries, existing & proposed structures, building & area square footages, building
		height, areas to be demolished, parking, site topography, conceptual grading & retaining walls, & existing landscaping. Include footprints
		of adjacent structures.
		Exterior elevations - showing existing & proposed grading where applicable.
	Suggested	Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.
		Plans - floor, roof, etc.
		Rough sketches are encouraged early in the process for initial design review to avoid pursuing incompatible proposals. However, more
		complete & thorough information is recommended to facilitate an efficient review of the project.
PRELIMINARY	Required	Same as above with the following additions:
REVIEW		Plans - floor, roof, etc.
		Site Sections - showing the relationship of the proposed building & grading where applicable.
		Preliminary Landscape Plans - required for commercial & multi-family; single family projects where grading occurs. Preliminary planting
		plan with proposed trees & shrubs & plant list with names. Plans to include street parkway strips.
	Suggested	Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" & detailed on all sets of plans.
		Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.
		Materials submitted for preliminary approval form the basis for working drawings & must be complete & accurate.
FINAL &	Required	Same as above with the following additions:
CONSENT		Color & Material Samples - to be mounted on a board no larger than 8.5" x 14" and detailed on all sets of plans.
		<u>Cut Sheets</u> - exterior light fixtures and accessories where applicable.
		Exterior Details - windows, doors, eaves, railings, chimney caps, flashing, etc.
		Final Landscape Plans - landscape construction documents including planting & irrigation plan.
		Consultant/Engineer Plans - electrical, mechanical, structural, & plumbing where applicable.

PLEASE BE ADVISED

- ** All approvals made by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) are based on compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 22.22 and with adopted HLC guidelines. Some agenda items have received a mailed notice and are subject to a public hearing.
- ** The approximate time the project will be reviewed is listed to the left of each item. It is suggested that applicants arrive 15 minutes early. The agenda schedule is subject to change as cancellations occur. Staff will notify applicants of time changes.
- ** The applicant's presence is required. If an applicant is not present, the item will be postponed indefinitely. If an applicant cancels or postpones an item without providing advance notice, the item will be postponed indefinitely and will not be placed on the following HLC agenda. In order to reschedule the item for review, the applicant must fill out and file a Supplemental Application Form at 630 Garden Street (Community Development Department) and submit appropriate plans.
- ** The Commission may grant an approval for any project scheduled on the agenda if sufficient information has been provided and no other discretionary review is required. Substitution of plans is not allowed, if revised plans differing from the submittal sets are brought to the meeting, motions for preliminary or final approval will be contingent upon staff review for code compliance.
- ** Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval is valid for one year from the date of the approval unless a time extension or Building Permit has been granted.
- ** The Commission may refer items to the Consent Calendar for Preliminary and Final Historic Landmarks Commission approval.
- ** Items before the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. For further information on appeals, contact the Planning Division Staff or the City Clerk's Office. Said appeal must be in writing and must be filed with the City Clerk at City Hall within ten (10) calendar days of the meeting at which the Commission took action or rendered its decision. The scope of this project may be modified under further review.
- ** AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT: In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the Planning Division at (805) 564-5470. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.
- ** AGENDAS, MINUTES and REPORTS: Copies of all documents relating to agenda items are available for review at 630 Garden St. and agendas and minutes are posted online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc. If you have any questions or wish to review the plans, please contact Susan Gantz, at (805) 564-5470 between the hours of 8:30 a.m. to noon and 1:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

LICENSING ADVISORY:

The Business and Professions Code of the State of California and the Municipal Code of the City of Santa Barbara restrict preparation of plans for certain project types to licensed professionals. Applicants are encouraged to consult with Building and Safety Staff or Planning Staff to verify requirements for their specific projects.

Unlicensed persons are limited to the preparation of plans for:

- Single or multiple family dwellings not to exceed four (4) units per lot, of wood frame construction, and not more than two stories and basement in height;
- Non-structural changes to storefronts; and,
- Landscaping for single-family dwellings, or projects consisting solely of landscaping of not more than 5,000 square feet.

NOTICE:

- A. That on May 11, 2007, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc.
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission will be broadcast live and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 P.M. and again the following Friday at 1:00 P.M. on Channel 18.

GENERAL BUSINESS (1:33):

A. Public Comment:

Any member of the public may address the Historic Landmarks Commission for up to two minutes on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled for a public discussion before the Board on that day. The total time for this item is ten minutes. (Public comment for items scheduled on today's agenda will be taken at the time the item is heard.)

No public comment.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of May 2, 2007.

Motion: Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of

May 2, 2007, with corrections.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar.

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by William La Voie.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 7/0/0. (Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.
 - 1. Chair La Voie stated that, in order to benefit the public and the applicant, it is important to state in the motions whether the Commission has liked the project's design or if it is not supportable. He provided a list of formulated comments and suggested the HLC members commence their comments with a similar phrase, although the exact language does not need to be used. Chair La Voie asked that, if requesting that an element be redesigned, the HLC members *not* use the wording "the applicant should study." The general building design, the size, bulk and scale, and the building massing should be commented on first. Then the acceptable elements as well as those that are not supportable need to be clearly identified.

Ms. Naylor reminded the Commission that the HLC's purpose is not to redesign the project for the applicant and should not make suggestions as to how to design it. The applicant should simply be directed to redesign the project when the design is not acceptable.

- 2. Ms. Gantz made the following announcements:
 - a) Commissioner Hausz would be absent.
 - b) Commissioner Naylor would be stepping down from Item 10, 320 E. Victoria Street.
 - c) Item 11, 433 E. Cabrillo Blvd., was postponed indefinitely at the applicant's request until after obtaining a substantial conformance determination from the Planning Commission.

Motion: To postpone Item 11, 433 E. Cabrillo Blvd., at applicant's request.

Action: Adams/Murray, 7/0/0. (Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

- d) Addison Cook (1816 Santa Barbara Street) and Trevor Martinson (1849 Mission Ridge Road) have appealed the Historic Landmarks Commission's decision to retain certain structures on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Chair La Voie requested that the Commission be informed when the hearing dates are scheduled.
- e) The City will begin a new 9/80 work schedule July 9th and every other Friday the Community Development building will be closed. The Planning/Zoning Counter will be open during lunch and July 13th will be the first Friday that the office will be closed.
- f) The Santa Barbara Historical Society (in conjunction with the Santa Barbara Historic Homes) asked Jaime Limón, Senior Planner/Design Review Supervisor, to conduct a workshop entitled "An Evening Workshop on Historic and Landmark Designations in Santa Barbara." The workshop is scheduled on May 29th, 5:30 to 7:30 p.m., at the Historical Museum, 136 E. De La Guerra Street.
 - Mr. Limón reported he attended a meeting with the Association of Realtors and gave a debriefing about the function of the Demolition Review Ordinance. He also explained the distinction between a property that is designated as a City Landmark and one that is on the Potential Historic Structures/Sites List. It was then that Mr. Limón was asked to participate in the previously mentioned workshop.
 - Mr. Limón will be requesting feedback from property owners as to incentives that may encourage designation of properties. He is preparing a report for City Council that will examine the Mills Act, zoning relief, and other incentives.
- 3. Mr. Adams asked about the new Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance and whether it is now in effect. Mr. Limón responded that, with the creation of the new Single-Family Design Board (SFDB), the department is preparing by updating its computer system and the information that is provided to the public. Handouts will be available in the near future to help answer questions about the retroactivity of the Ordinance and whether projects can move forward to receive comments from the Architectural Board of Review or should wait for the SFDB to review. The board agendas will now include the FAR proposed for those projects and a checklist will be created to assist the boards to ascertain whether an applicant is in full compliance with the Ordinance.

E. Subcommittee Reports.

1. Chair La Voie reported that the Airport Subcommittee met and the interior design was reviewed. The designers were directed to match the exterior so that it is also compatible with the Santa Barbara style.

- 2. Ms. Gantz reported that El Pueblo Viejo (EPV) Guidelines Subcommittee will be meeting on Wednesday, May 16th, and photographs will be reviewed. She reminded the Subcommittee members that they were assigned to retake some of the photographs.
 - Mr. Limón commented that Commissioner Sharpe suggested incorporating the EPV Guidelines with the current Urban Design Guidelines. The Subcommittee will be discussing the possibility of creating one document, rather than producing several parts.
- 3. Mr. Adams reported on the Awards Subcommittee and stated that the recently awarded plaques will be finished by the end of June. The City Council ceremony should be occurring before the (Old Spanish Days) Fiesta (which begins on August 1st).
- F. Possible Ordinance Violations.

No violations reported.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

1. 111 BURTON CIR R-4/SD-3 Zone

(1:47) Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-063-007 Application Number: MST2007-00227

Owner: Paul and Jill Cook

Architect: Ted Meeder

(Proposal to convert a two unit two-story duplex into a single family residence, to construct 375 square foot one & two-story additions, to demo and rebuild a 400 square foot two-car garage. The proposal includes the abatement of violations outlined in ENF2006-00776.)

(Review of Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates.)

Present: Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian

Paul Cook, Owner Ted Meeder, Architect

<u>Staff comments:</u> Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, stated that Staff reviewed the Historic Structures Report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners can support the statement that the proposed additions are an enhancement to the architectural style of the house as stated on page 16 of the report?

2/5. (Adams/Boucher/La Voie/Naylor/Sharpe opposed.).

How many Commissioners do not agree that the additions are an enhancement and disagree with the findings? 5/2. (La Voie/Pujo opposed.)

Motion: To accept the report with the following condition and comments: 1) There shall be a

conditional agreement with the conclusion that the proposed additions are an enhancement to the building. The enhancements are the replacement of non-historic materials. 2) **The following comments shall be forwarded to the Architectural Board of Review:** a) The new cupola for stair access to the roof is an element that is considered incompatible with the design of the building. b) The ABR should address the impacts of

the terrace on the integrity of the building's design.

Action: Naylor/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

The item was reopened at 1:59 p.m. to consider Mr. Pujo's additional comment: The plan shows the proposed roof terrace substantially larger than shown in the elevation drawing.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

2. 1210-1216 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(2:01) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019 Application Number: MST2005-00323

Owner: Granada Tower, LLC
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis, LLP

(This is a revised project description: This structure is on the City's List of Potential Historic Resources. Proposal to convert the 7th, 8th, and a portion of the 9th floor (approximately 6,444 square feet) from office space to 2 residential condominium units. The project also includes replacing the existing exterior fire escape with a new stair tower, replacing the existing wood frame roof structure with a new steel frame roof structure, constructing a recessed rooftop mechanical equipment well with roof access stairs, adding rooftop dormers and windows, and reopening existing window rough openings (2 windows each on six floors), and adding wrought iron railing at the 7th floor patio on the south elevation of the Granada Tower. This is on the City's Potential Historic Resources list.)

(Review of addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates, dealing with proposed temporary scaffolding.)

Present: Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian

<u>Staff comments:</u> Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, stated that Staff reviewed the Letter Report (addendum) to the Historic Structures Report and agrees with its conclusion that the temporary installations of a trash shoot and materials lift as detailed in the Letter Report will not negatively impact the historic façade of the building.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Naylor/Sharpe, 7/0/0. (Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

3. 1137 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(2:02) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-037 Application Number: MST2007-00049

Owner: 1129 State Street, LP

Applicant: Glen Morris
Applicant: Carole Denardo

Business Name: Old Navy (Formerly Copeland's)

(This is on the California Inventory of Historic Resources and the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "San Marcos Court Building." Proposal for a new storefront on an existing commercial building on an approximately 52,000 square foot parcel.)

(Review of Addendum to Historic Structures/Sites Report prepared by Carole A. Denardo, Architectural Historian.)

Present: Carole Denardo, Architectural Historian

Glen Morris, Architect James Drews, Architect

<u>Staff comments:</u> Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, stated that Staff reviewed Addendum II and agrees with is conclusions and recommendations. Staff expressed disappointment that all the parties could not get together and restore the original arched storefront system. However, as pointed out in the report, this proposal represents a vast improvement over the current conditions.

Public hearing opened at 2:15 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, local resident, asked whether the Commission can ask the applicant or the owner of the building that the original storefront arch openings be restored, since they were ruined when Woolworth took over the building's corner. Mr. De Forest stated that it would be wonderful if the report had strong language to indicate the importance of the restoration of the arches. He also asked if the original rectangular square in the courtyard could be restored. Chair La Voie clarified the report is not addressing all the changes made by Woolworth, but rather changes to the façade on State Street.

Public hearing closed at 2:28 p.m.

Motion:

To accept the report, but not accept the recommendations, with the following comment and conditions: 1) The Commission disagrees with the analysis described on page A-14, Standard 5, where it states that the existing column should be protected, and recommends that the arches be restored in a manner consistent with the Myron Hunt/Harold Chambers design. 2) The following amendments shall be made to the report: a) On page A-3, the last paragraph, change the wording "the building was decimated" to "a third of the building was destroyed." b) On page A-4, the second line, correct the use of the word "resurrected" to one more appropriate to describe that it was not a resurrection of the previous building, but rather a new building that did not incorporate any of the elements from the original building. c) On page A-13, first line, use the word "change" in place of "disrupt." d) On page A-16, under Mitigation Measure 1, correct the wording to state that this is a "Churrigueresque inspired architectural style." e) Under Mitigation 2, change the word "similar" to "identical."

f) Under Mitigation 4, change the wording to indicate that the shape of the awnings should emulate the traditional design and detail of the awnings shown on page A-5, Plate 3 (overview of the State Street façade photographed in 1926).

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 7/0/0. (Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

4. 1137 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(2:22) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-231-037

Application Number: MST2007-00049 Owner: 1129 State Street, LP

Applicant: Glen Morris
Applicant: Carole Denardo

Business Name: Old Navy (Formerly Copeland's)

(This is on the California Inventory of Historic Resources and the City's List of Potential Historic Resources: "San Marcos Court Building." Proposal for a new storefront on an existing commercial building on an approximately 52,000 square foot parcel.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Present: Carole Denardo, Architectural Historian

Glen Morris, Architect James Drews, Architect

Public comment opened at 2:30 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, local resident, commented that, although the arches may not be opened as they were originally, the applicant could find a way to mimic the arches without destroying the current façade.

Public comment closed at 2:31 p.m.

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The Sunbrella Mediterranean

tweed is an acceptable color for the awnings. 2) The Commission finds the proposal marginally acceptable. 3) What would make the proposal acceptable is to:
a) Reestablish the arches on the State and Anapamu Streets elevations. b) Recess the flat panel (transom) as far into the building as possible. A minimum would be the recess that is on Anapamu Street. c) Recess the storefront at least 12 inches off the sidewalk. 4) The storefront system should be wood. 5) The proposal should indicate the original color of the building and the original storefront extant in the courtyard. 6) The design of the awnings should match in shape the original design indicated on page A-5, Plate 3, found

in the historical document and should have a traditional design.

Action: Boucher/Pujo, 7/0/0. (Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

HISTORIC STRUCTURES REPORT

5. 924-J GARDEN ST C-2 Zone

(2:45) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-026 Application Number: MST2006-00557

Owner: Collinge Trust
Owner: Wayne Ashcraft
Agent: Barbara Beisel
Architect: Kirk Gradin

(This is a revised project description. This is a City Landmark: El Caserío. Proposal to remove an existing 223 square foot accessory building and 345 square foot carport and construct a 910 square foot, two-story addition (including an eight square foot deck) to an existing 928 square foot single-family residence. Staff Hearing officer approval will be required to allow two uncovered parking spaces to be located within the required front and interior yard setback, and for a wall located within the first 10 feet of the front lot line to exceed a maximum height of 3½ feet. The parcel is approximately 3,900 square feet in size. The proposal has a floor-to-lot-area ratio of .23.)

(Review of focused Historic Structures/Sites Letter Report prepared by Alexandra C. Cole, Preservation Planning Associates.)

Present: Alexandra Cole, Architectural Historian

Kirk Gradin, Architect Lynn Ashcraft, Owner

<u>Staff comments:</u> Susan Gantz, Planning Technician II, stated that Staff reviewed the Focused Letter Report and generally agrees with its conclusions and recommendations. Staff requested that the Commission specifically address the following issues during its consideration of the report: 1) The replacement of the original window in the dining room with a pair of French doors represents a further loss of original materials and may be a potential cumulative impact. 2) The proposed French doors make good design sense by providing direct access to the patio from the dining room.

Motion: To accept the report as presented.

Action: Sharpe/Adams, 7/0/0. (Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

6. 924-J GARDEN ST C-2 Zone

(2:47) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-301-026 Application Number: MST2006-00557

Owner: Collinge Trust
Owner: Wayne Ashcraft
Agent: Barbara Beisel
Architect: Kirk Gradin

(This is a revised project description. This is a City Landmark: El Caserío. Proposal to remove an existing 223 square foot accessory building and 345 square foot carport and construct a 910 square foot, two-story addition (including an eight square foot deck) to an existing 928 square foot single-family residence. Staff Hearing officer approval will be required to allow two uncovered parking spaces to be located within the required front and interior yard setback, and for a wall located within the first 10 feet of the front lot line to exceed a maximum height of $3\frac{1}{2}$ feet. The parcel is approximately 3,900 square feet in size. The proposal has a floor-to-lot-area ratio of .23.)

(Final approval of the project is requested.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES HISTORIC RESOURCE FINDINGS, FINDINGS FOR ALTERATIONS TO A CITY LANDMARK, AND COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF HEARING OFFICER RESOLUTION NO. #020-07.)

Present: Kirk Gradin, Architect

Lynn Ashcraft, Owner

Straw vote: How many Commissioners are troubled by the French doors? 2/5. (Adams/Boucher/

La Voie/Naylor/Pujo opposed.)

Motion: Final approval of the project and the chimney details shall be reviewed on the

Consent Calendar, with the following comments and condition: 1) The design is acceptable. 2) The colors are acceptable. 3) The chimney on the upper story roof shall be redesigned to be more in keeping with a functioning chimney. 4) The following findings are made: a) Historic Resource Findings: The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource. b) Alterations to a City Landmark Findings: The exterior alterations are being made primarily for the purposes of restoring the landmark to its original appearance or in order to substantially

aid in the preservation or enhancement of the Landmark.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 7/0/0. (Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

7. 1214 STATE ST C-2 Zone

(3:01) Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-183-019 Application Number: MST2004-00005

Owner: Santa Barbara Center for Performing Arts Architect: Phillips, Metsch, Sweeney & Moore

Business Name: Granada Theatre

(The proposed project involves the partial rehabilitation of and modifications to the Granada Theatre, including an addition of 13,360 square feet. Of the 13,360 square feet proposed, 6,634 square feet would be added to the building's footprint. The existing dressing rooms on the north side of the theater would be rebuilt with a 99-foot long, five-foot wide and 60-foot high addition to accommodate stage space, exiting, storage, and equipment, as well as a fully accessible dressing room and toilet. An 80-foot long, 10-foot wide and 78-foot high addition to the east side of the theater would provide more stage space and meet stage rigging needs. The south side addition, which is 100 feet long, eight feet wide and 36 feet high, would accommodate access ramps inside the building. The remaining 6,700 square feet would be for the construction of a basement level to provide dressing rooms for the performers. One of the existing ground floor storefronts adjacent to the theater's entrance would be utilized as the theater's ticketing area. Space in the Granada tower at the second floor would also be utilized for the theater's second floor lobby area.)

(Continued final approval of entrance door details is requested.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 049-04.)

Present: Steve Metsch, Architect

Monisha Adnani, Project Manager

Motion: Final approval of entry door details with the recommendation that the bronze grille

be made operable to facilitate maintenance.

Action: Naylor/Pujo, 6/0/1. (Murray abstained. Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

8. 1722 STATE ST C-2/R-1 Zone

(3:17) Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-102-021

Application Number: MST2005-00455 Owner: 1722 State Street Investors, LLC

Architect: Jan Hochhauser Applicant: Howard Gross

(Proposal for a three story commercial mixed-use development consisting of twelve residential condominium units with approximately 10,000 square feet of commercial development. The residential units would consist of four 3-bedroom units, six 2-bedroom units, and two 1-bedroom units. In accordance with the Inclusionary Housing Ordinance, one 2-bedroom and one 1-bedroom residential units would be affordable. Parking to accommodate 50 to 60 cars will be located in a subterranean parking garage. The existing 7,500 square foot commercial structure on this 28,875 square foot lot will be demolished as part of this proposal.)

(Third Concept Review.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPIANCE WITH PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NUMBER 015-07.)

Present: Jan Hochhauser and Jay Blatter, Architects

Phil Suding, Landscape Architect

Straw vote: How many Commissioners find the south property line acceptable in terms of

landscaping buffer? 6/1. (Sharpe abstained.)

How many Commissioners could support increasing the encroachment of the building into the proposed landscaping in order to increase the landscaping in other areas along State Street? 5/2. (Murray/Sharpe opposed).

How many Commissioners would agree that the planting strip would need to be a minimum of two feet along the State Street sidewalk? 6/1.

How many Commissioners would agree that the design of the tower is acceptable as presented? 0/7. (All opposed.)

How many Commissioners would agree that the project is ready for preliminary approval? 2/5. (Boucher/La Voie/Murray/Pujo/Sharpe opposed.)

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) The architectural design is

generally acceptable and the site plan is marginally acceptable. 2) Provide more information about the major window and terrace interface. 3) The building setback along the southern property line is acceptable as presented. 4) Increase planting along State Street so that no planting space created is less than 24 inches deep. 5) Continue refining

the tower element.

Action: La Voie/Adams, 6/0/1. (Sharpe abstained. Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED

9. 1025 SANTA BARBARA ST

C-2 Zone

(4:11) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-211-007
Application Number: MST2006-00224
Owner: Haywards Family Partnership
Architect: Cearnal Andrulaitis Architects

(Proposal to demolish 14,602 square feet of existing commercial buildings, demolish surface parking with 45 spaces and construct a new, four-story mixed-use project with 26,383 square feet of underground parking, 12,397 square feet of commercial space and 29,572 square feet of one, two and three bedroom condominium units (15 units total) on four separate parcels (APNs 029-211-006, -007, -008, and -009) totaling 31,310 square feet. Two of the condominium units would be affordable. Approximately 12,250 cubic yards of grading excavation is proposed as a part of this project. Planning Commission approval will be required for a Tentative Subdivision Map and a modification of the lot area requirements to allow two over-density units.)

(Fourth Concept Review.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PLANNING COMMISSION APPROVAL.)

Present: Brian Cearnal and Jeff Hornbuckle, Cearnal Andrulaitis Architects

Hugh Hayward, Owner

Public comment opened at 4:29 p.m.

Kellam De Forest, local resident, inquired about the HLC's perview in preventing buildings with elements over 40 feet to be approved, especially in El Pueblo Viejo District. He considered a fourth floor for this project unacceptable. Chair La Voie responded that, until the Zoning Ordinance is amended, the HLC cannot force a maximum 40 foot building height for proposed projects.

Public comment closed at 4:30 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely with the following comments: 1) The project is generally

acceptable. 2) The size, bulk, and scale are acceptable. 3) Following are elements of the design considered commendable: a) The amount of landscape along Santa Barbara Street. b) The replication of the original Hayward's building. c) The full submersion of the parking below grade. d) The architectural design sensitive to the requirements of the

Historic Landmarks Commission.

Action: Pujo/Naylor, 4/1/2. (Boucher opposed because she did not agree with placing a fourth

floor in this location. Adams/Sharpe abstained. Hausz absent.) Motion carried.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

10. 320 E VICTORIA ST R-3 Zone

(4:33) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-131-005 Application Number: MST2004-00511

> Owner: Victoria Garden Mews Architect: Dennis Thompson

(This is a second revision of the project description. Proposal to retain the front, two-story portion of an existing single-family residence, add a new porch at the street facade, remove the one-story portion at the rear of the house, and add a new two-story addition. Also proposed is to demolish an existing storage shed and garages at the rear of the property and construct three new residential units with four attached two-car garages accessed from the public alley. The new units are proposed to vary between 1,000 and 1,800 square feet each and total approximately 6,931 net square feet, including the new garages. Solar panels are proposed to be installed on both residential buildings.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH STAFF HEARING OFFICER RESOLUTION NO. 009-07.)

Present: Jeff King, Thompson Naylor Architects

Dennis Allen, Owner

Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments: 1) Provide abundant photographs

of the building from all angles. 2) Show in the plans what is new and what is existing on the elevations. 3) Resolve the architectural elements to be consistent with the American

Vernacular Style.

Action: Pujo/Boucher, 4/0/2. (Adams/Sharpe abstained. Naylor stepped down. Hausz absent.)

Motion carried.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

11. 433 E CABRILLO BLVD

HRC-2/SP-1/SD-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-680-009 Application Number: MST95-00175 Agent: Richard Fogg, Attorney

Architect: Daun St. Amand
Business Name: Waterfront Hotel
Architect: Henry Lenny
Architect: Gregory Burnett
Applicant: Parker Family Trust

(This is a revised proposal for a 150-room, three-story luxury hotel located on a three-acre development envelope that received a substantial conformance determination on June 1, 2001. The proposal is a 196,715 square foot hotel that includes 128 subterranean level parking spaces, pool cabana, spas, health club, meeting rooms, and restaurant. The project previously received preliminary approval from the Historic Landmarks Commission on August 15, 2001.)

(Continued from May 2, 2007: Revised preliminary approval is requested of design changes to exterior elevations including doors, windows and balconies. Massing and footprint of the building remains unmodified.)

(PROJECT REQUIRES COMPLIANCE WITH CITY ORDINANCE NO. 4920.)

This item was postponed at applicant's request.

CONSENT CALENDAR

CONTINUED ITEM

A. 906 W MISSION ST R-1 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 043-073-012 Application Number: MST2007-00196

Owner: Pini Dario Architect: Bryan Murphy

(This structure is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List. Proposal to paint the exterior of an existing Victorian duplex and detached duplex to the rear of the parcel, which is outside of El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District.)

(Second Concept Review.)

Final approval with the recommendation that a brick red color be used on the front door and other places as a minimum accent.

NEW ITEM

B. 431 STATE ST C-M Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-008 Application Number: MST2007-00237 Owner: William & Dolores Faulding

Applicant: Santokh Singh Business Name: All India Cafe

(Proposal to permit new "as-built" rooftop equipment to abate violation ENF2007-00294.)

Continued two weeks.

NEW ITEM

C. 317 E CARRILLO ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-221-018 Application Number: MST2007-00236

Owner: Vista De Carrillo, Ltd.

Applicant: Gina Giannetto

(Proposal to add one new window and shadow line on the east elevation of an existing, 5,981 square foot three-story commercial building.)

Continued two weeks.

NEW ITEM

D. 836 ANACAPA ST C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-011-001 Application Number: MST2007-00225

Owner: U.S. Federal Government

Applicant: Kayode F. Kadera

Designer: RJC, Inc.

(This is on the National Register of Historic Places and is a City Landmark: "Santa Barbara Post Office." Courtesy review of a proposal to restore the existing tile roof system and existing windows on the second floor.)

Final approval and Historic Resource Findings are made as follows: The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource.

NEW ITEM

E. 700 E ANAPAMU ST R-3 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-180-009 Application Number: MST2007-00240 Owner: Santa Barbara High School District

(This is a City Landmark: "Santa Barbara High School Building." Courtesy review of a proposal for new outdoor benches and trash receptacles.)

Final approval with site plan to return to Staff, allowing no more than eight benches and four trash receptacles. Trash receptacles may be of a similar design as presented.

** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:58 P.M. **